



NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF
DESIGN + CONSTRUCTION

DAVID J. BURNEY, FAIA
Commissioner

ERIC C. MACFARLANE, P.E.
Deputy Commissioner
Infrastructure

YUN POY (DINO) NG, P.E.
Associate Commissioner
Design

Project: Requirements Contract for Engineering Design and Related Services for Large/Small Infrastructure Projects, Citywide

Pin: 8502014VP0001-20P

Date: October 24, 2013

Time: 10:00 AM

To: All Attendees

From: Carlo Di Fava/Hemwattie Roopnarine

Minutes of October 24, 2013 Pre-Proposal Conference

Attendees:

Carlo Di Fava – DDC/ACCO	Corenzo Wilkerson – DDC/Infrastructure
Lindsey Berkahn – DDC/Infrastructure	Bob Pour-Azar – DDC/Infrastructure
Mohsen Zargarelahi – DDC/Infrastructure	Diana Benjamin – DDC/ACCO
Donna Pope – DDC/ACCO	Hemwattie Roopnarine – DDC/ACCO

On October 24, 2013 at 10:00 AM, a Pre-Proposal Conference was held at the LaGuardia Community College for the Requirements Contract for Engineering Design and Related Services for Large and Small Infrastructure Projects hereafter referred to as Large and Small contracts.

Carlo Di Fava opened the meeting and mentioned the following aspects of both RFPs, including:

- Due dates for the Large and Small contracts; The Small contract is due on November 12, 2013 and the Large Contract is due on November 18, 2013.
- Questions are allowed up to one week before each proposal due date.
- The Proposal Package Contents listed on RFP-11 and RFP-12 were reminded to follow the instructions.





- The Fee Proposal (Attachment 6) should be submitted in a separate sealed envelope along with the Technical Proposal package. The selected consultants will be required to provide backup information (Part 3 of Attachment 6) at a later date.

Infrastructure/Design Assistant Commissioner, Mohsen Zargarelahi, gave an overview of the Large and Small contracts and mentioned changes to the General Requirements for Design Services, including:

- The base terms of the Large and Small contracts will be four (4) years (1,460 Consecutive Calendar Days), and at the Commissioner's sole option, the term of the contract may be renewed for one (1) year (365 ccds), and/or extended for one (1) year (365 ccds). Both contracts will have a value of \$8 Million each for the base term, and additional \$2 Million each for the renewal term.
- Construction costs would determine whether a project would be assigned to the Large or the Small contract. Any projects with construction costs over \$8 Million would be assigned to the Large contract and any project with construction costs less than or equal to \$8 Million will be assigned to Small contract. There may be situations where a project would be considered complex, and DDC reserves the right to assign these projects to the Large contract based on their complexities and the required expertise that the Large firms may retain.
- The Large and the Small contracts are for Citywide work and the consultants would be selected using "Quality Based Selection" process and a total of 10 (ten) consultants will be selected for the Large and Small contracts respectively. The Large contract would be assigned to the Large firms and the Small contracts would be assigned to the Small firms. Any firm with more than 50 technical personnel will be considered a "Large Firm" and firm with 50 or lower number of technical personnel will be considered a "Small Firm".
- The evaluation criteria for consultants for the Large and the Small contracts will be selected based on the following criteria listed on Section V.B on RFP-13.
- The desired DBE goal assigned to the Large and Small contracts is 18% each for the entire contract. If a consultant meets or exceeds the desired percentage in its proposal, a maximum of 10 points would be added to its evaluation score. If a consultant proposes DBE percentage less than 18%, the points assigned for meeting the desired DBE goal would be proportioned accordingly and the result would be added to the consultant's evaluation score.
- The consultant selection will be done based on the final scores and the 10 (ten) highest ranked consultants will be selected for each of the Large and the Small contracts.
- The task order assignments would be by the way of the mini-RFP process, and depending upon whether the task order is assigned to the Large or Small contract, the 10 (ten) consultants selected for that contract would compete for the task order and all 10 (ten) consultants will have an equal opportunity to compete on all task orders.
- Joint ventures are allowed. Only Small firms together or Large firms together can form a joint venture.





- Any Large firm submitting proposal for the Large contract cannot be a sub-consultant to a Small firm submitting proposal for Small contract.
- The projects that would be assigned to the Small and Large contracts Infrastructure projects would be either City or Federally funded. All Federally funded projects must comply with DBE requirements, and all City funded projects must comply with M/WBE requirements.
- The M/WBE assigned to the projects will be evaluated on task order basis.
- If a firm with no DDC experience proposes for the Large and the Small contracts, it would not be counted against them, provided that the firm provide information on the work it has performed in the past eight (8) years that is similar to DDC work.
- Changes to the General Requirements were mentioned which include, but are not limited to:
 - a) Arborist – Previously this work was under reimbursable services, and now it is considered a professional service and therefore, this title must be staffed. The Arborist must be certified and the requirements are specified in Exhibit D of the contract.
 - b) Traffic Study Program – This section has been revised to include the NYCDOT's new Traffic requirements and standards. When performing this task, the Consultant will have to share the traffic data recorded with NYCDOT via the TIMS program. Instructions will be provided to the selected consultants to upload traffic data onto the NYCDOT TIMS program for their assigned task orders, as applicable.
 - c) Construction Support Services – Previously this task was only for Landscape/Architect work. This task has been revised and is now applicable to both Engineering and Landscape/Architect work for resolving issues during construction as they come up.
- The Resumes for the proposed staff should be limited to 2 (two) pages only.
- For the Fee Proposal, the proposed hourly rates as submitted by the consultant would remain the same during the base term of the contract (4 years) and during renewal (1 year) and extension (1 year) terms the adjustment to the hourly rates would only be done in accordance with the employment cost index.

Bob Pour-Azar, Infrastructure/Design Director, notified the attendees about the format of their proposals, including:

- The emphasis should be given to the content and the allowed number of pages indicated in Forms 254 and 255. He highlighted that Forms 254 and 255 should not be altered in any way.
- For the past experience, on page RFP-9, the proposer is to use Item 8 on Form 255 and put only 8 years worth of projects and list only what is requested on the form. For the expertise the proposer can list the information on Item 10 but it has to be limited to 3 pages.





- Any information longer than three (3) pages will not be considered. Workload on columns A and B should be filled in firm-wide and the number of staff where the projects will be worked on.

Donna Pope, Director of the Office of Contract Opportunity, ACCO unit, reviewed the M/WBE requirement and process, including:

- She indicated that there had been changes to the applicable Local Law. Some of the changes are as follows: \$1 million cap has been eliminated, and the distinction between the Prime and the sub-consultant has been eliminated.
- Under Local Law 1, at this time if a Prime is a M/WBE firm, the firm can get credit for M/WBE participation. In the past, the M/WBE goals were provided upfront and this is no longer the case.
- M/WBE goals will be set on a task order Basis. Schedule B Part 1 will be filled out by the Agency and Part 2 will have to be filled out by the consultant. Part 1 and Part 2 must be included in the proposal package and if it is not included in the proposal, the proposal would be considered “non-responsive.”
- She reiterated that the form must be signed and mentioned that if consultants have any questions they could inquire with Diana Benjamin at benjamdi@ddc.nyc.gov . The website address to find the list of certified M/WBE subconsultants was given as www.nyc.gov/sbs.

The following is a summation of questions and answers from the conference. The following should be considered the official responses to the questions.

Question: Can the answer to Item 8 of Form 255 exceed more than one (1) page?

Answer: The answer shall not exceed one (1) page.

Question: The Technical Approach should not be more than four (4) pages?

Answer: The Technical Approach shall not exceed four (4) pages.

Question: Can graphic be included in the Technical Approach?

Answer: Yes, graphics can be included. But it is up to the proposer to decide what he/she would want to include in the four (4) page allotment.

Question: Will there be 10 Large firms and 10 Small firms selected, or 10 firms in total be assigned to Large and Small contracts?

Answer: There will be 10 Large firms selected for the Large contract, and 10 Small firms will be selected for the Small contract.





Question: Can a Small firm proposing for Small contract be a sub-consultant to a Large firm that is proposing for the Large contract?

Answer: Yes, a Small firm proposing for the Small Contract can be a sub-consultant to a Large firm proposing for the Large Contract.

Question: Can a Small firm proposing as prime for the Small contract be in a Joint Venture with another Small firm?

Answer: No, a Small firm proposing for the Small contract cannot be in a Joint Venture relationship with another Small firm.

Question: How would these Large and Small contracts work in conjunction with the three (3) existing Large and Small contracts?

Answer: DDC will decide what will happen to the existing contracts at a later date. For now, task order assignments will continue for the existing Large and Small contracts until a further determination is made.

Question: How will the structural engineer be involved in this contract?

Answer: Based on past projects, DDC has assigned projects where structural engineering services were required; examples are retaining walls, embankment protection, step streets and waterfront structures. DDC has included this title into the Large and Small contracts for any structural design work that may arise.

Question: Will the structural engineer be working on buildings or vertical construction?

Answer: No, this work is not for designing buildings.

Question: Are the Key Personnel resumes the only ones to be submitted?

Answer: The proposer must submit the resumes for the Key Personnel and for the senior staff performing work under various disciplines indicated in the proposer's organization chart.

Question: The RFP asks for the Key Personnel to be identified. Are these the only personnel that are to be identified?

Answer: The Key Personnel as well as the senior staff for all disciplines indicated in the proposer's organization chart must be identified.

Question: For DBE, do the proposers have to propose a DBE goal now?

Answer: Yes, a DBE goal needs to be affirmed upfront and the goal must be met by the end of the contract term.

Question: Can a Prime be a DBE and count toward fulfillment of the DBE percentage?

Answer: No, only sub-consultants can count for the DBE percentage.





Question: Do the proposers have to identify the DBE and M/WBE sub-consultants upfront?

Answer: Yes, the proposers would be evaluated based on the entire staffing and capabilities which include sub-consultants and therefore, all sub-consultants including the DBE and M/WBE sub-consultants should be identified in the proposal.

Question: Is there a limit to the number of Key Personnel Resumes?

Answer: There is no limit to the number of Key Personnel and multiple staff of the same title that must be identified under the key personnel titles. However, the resume for each one of the identified staff must be limited to two (2) pages only.

Question: Does DDC know what the percentage of the contracts that must comply with DBE and M/WBE requirements would be?

Answer: No, depends upon the funding source the percentage would vary.

Question: Can a DBE firm be a sub-consultant to multiple primes?

Answer: Yes, a DBE firm can be a sub-consultant to multiple primes. But, there is a possibility that the DBE firm will end up with too much work which may impact the ability of the DBE firm for timely completion of the work.

Question: For M/WBE, please explain what "W" stands for?

Answer: Unlike Local Law 129 which limited the WBE certification to Caucasian female, Local Law 1 supports goals for all ethnicities and women in ALL industries except for Asian-American in professional Services where the study found that there is no disparity between availability of firms and their utilization. Local Law 1 allows for dual certification for firms owned by women of color. These firms will be credited under their women category in Professional Service contracts.

Question: Similar to DBE, can a proposer get 10 points for M/WBE participation?

Answer: No, the 10 points are for DBE participation only.

Question: Does a Proposer have to name its subconsultants in its proposal?

Answer: Yes, all sub-consultants must be identified by the proposer. For establishment of rates, it is important to know who the sub-consultants are, and which titles they use.

Question: If the proposer shows a large organization chart with lots of sub-consultants involved, will this be held against the proposer?

Answer: No, DDC wants to see all the sub-consultants and the types of services they would be providing.

Question: Is the not to exceed amount of \$8 Million for the base term of the contract for each firm, or is it a total figure for all of the 10 selected firms?

Answer: Each of the selected firms will have a contract with a not to exceed amount of \$8 Million for the base term of the contract.





Question: Will the structural engineers be utilized for Pedestrian Bridge projects?

Answer: Not necessarily. However, similar projects may come up and structural engineers will be required for this work or other works that may need structural analyses (excluding buildings).

Question: If the Item 8 of Form 255 is limited to one (1) page, is there a location where proposers can show project sheets for all projects its firm has completed?

Answer: Proposers can show project sheets in item 10 but must adhere to the specified page limitations.

Question: Should the Joint Venture submit one combined 254/255 Forms? And what about the sub-consultants?

Answer: No, Joint Ventures and all sub-consultants need to submit separate 254/255 forms.

Question: When does a Joint Venture have to complete their VENDEX requirements?

Answer: This will need to be completed after the firms are selected.

Question: Does a firm have to provide a single Project Manager or several Project Managers?

Answer: We do not encourage a single project manager for the entire contract as the workload may become an issue. It is best for a firm to list multiple qualified project managers.

Question: Should all project engineers have a background in structures?

Answer: No, but proposers must have the ability to perform structural engineering work, if this type of work arises.

Question: Should a prime and sub-consultant submit Forms 254/255?

Answer: Yes the prime and all its sub-consultants must submit separate 254/255 Forms.

Question: For the Fee Proposal in Attachment 6, can the proposer submit separate multipliers and rates?

Answer: There should be one spreadsheet indicating the All-Inclusive Hourly Rates for the prime and its sub-consultants and for all titles, and one (1) unified All-Inclusive Hourly Rate for each title, agreed upon by the prime and its sub-consultants. Each prime and sub-consultant must separately submit their own multiplier.

Question: For Item 7 on Form 255, there is no place allotted for an organization chart. Where should the organization chart be shown?

Answer: A separate section can be created to show the organization chart and resumes.

Question: Can other titles be added to the ones listed under Attachment 6?

Answer: No.





Question: Key Personnel does not include the surveyor title. Is this correct?

Answer: Yes, but the surveyor must be identified in the organization chart.

Question: If the surveyor is not shown on the Key Personnel list, how does a proposer show the surveyor rates?

Answer: All-Inclusive Hourly Rates for the surveyor and all other titles shall be shown in Attachment 6.

Question: For future task orders, does DDC know the goals for DBE and M/WBE?

Answer: DDC does not know the goals until it receives the project information from the client agency. The desired DBE goal is 18%, but it is up to the proposer to set its goal and meet that goal for the entire contract. As for the M/WBE goal, it would be set on a Task Order basis.

Question: Will task orders be on a lump sum basis?

Answer: The majority of the task orders would most likely be on a lump sum basis, and consultants will have to provide staffing tables to justify the lump sums fees.

Question: Will all ten (10) selected consultants be required to submit proposals for each task order?

Answer: Yes, each of the ten selected consultants will be required to submit proposals for all given task orders.

Question: Will there be a situation where a selected consultant submits many proposals for task orders and does not get any work?

Answer: The chances of this is very unlikely due the anticipated volume of work, but cannot be guaranteed as the task orders would be assigned to the selected consultants based on "Quality Based Selection" process.

Question: If a consultant is selected and due to its workload would not be able to perform work for any future task orders, would that be held against them?

Answer: Attachment 5 of the RFP, Current and Anticipated Workload, will be filled out for each task order. Therefore, DDC will be able to judge whether or not a firm is overloaded with work. If the firm has a valid reason for not being able to take on additional work, it will not be penalized.

Question: If a firm is selected and receives a task order what goes into the proposal?

Answer: DDC will provide the scope of work and the consultant must provide the technical approach, schedule, the staffing requirements and the fee proposal.

Question: Will the task order be selection based on both Quality Based Selection, and based on the proposed Fees?

Answer: When the task order is issued, the consultant selection will be based on the technical approach and their schedule. Their fee would not be the determining factor.





Question: What will be the usual turnaround time for the task orders?

Answer: Our current turn-around time for task orders is usually about 3 weeks. However DDC is trying to make this duration shorter.

